

## Conference Report

N. Kivılcım Yavuz

**CONFERENCE TITLE:** NETWORK FOR THE STUDY OF CAROLINE MINUSCULE  
INAUGURAL COLLOQUIUM

**DATE AND LOCATION:** 23 MAY 2014, CAMBRIDGE, UK

**SPONSORED BY:** NETWORK FOR THE STUDY OF CAROLINE MINUSCULE, UNIVER-  
SITY OF CAMBRIDGE, UK

The year 2014 witnessed the formation of a much-needed forum: the Network for the Study of Caroline Minuscule (NSCM). Currently based at the University of Cambridge, the NSCM aims at bringing together scholars interested in the study of manuscripts written in Caroline minuscule. Their first event was the Inaugural Colloquium, held in the Milstein Seminar Rooms at the Cambridge University Library on 23 May 2014. Featuring fifteen speakers, the well-attended day-long colloquium was comprised of five sessions: ‘The Beginning’, ‘Individuals and the Development of Scriptoria’, ‘Scribal Practices’, ‘Caroline Minuscule in Italy’, and ‘The End’.

Following **Rosamond McKitterick**’s (University of Cambridge, UK) introductory remarks, the Colloquium commenced with a paper titled ‘Preconditions of Caroline Minuscule: Two Decades Later’ by **David Ganz** (University of Notre Dame, USA). In his paper, Ganz provided a re-evaluation of the ideas presented in his seminal article of the same title (‘The Preconditions for Caroline Minuscule’, *Viator* 18 [1987]: 23-44). Ganz emphasised that the minuscule was not in fact a Carolingian invention and argued that both the ‘tremendous desire to multiply texts’ as well as the readers of this peri-

od influenced the development of the script. The second paper in this session was **Birgit Ebersperger's** (Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München, Germany) paper titled 'On the Third Volume of Bischoff's *Katalog der festländischen Handschriften des neunten Jahrhunderts*'. The research carried out by Bernhard Bischoff (1906-1991) on ninth-century continental manuscripts has been posthumously published by Harrassowitz Publishing House under the editorial guidance of Ebersperger, with the first volume appearing in 1998 and the second in 2004. In her talk, Ebersperger elaborated on the challenges and the decisions made regarding the production of the long-awaited third and final volume, which includes descriptions of a further 3772 manuscripts and covers the entries for Padua-Zwickau.

Following this first session called 'The Beginnings', the first paper of the second session, 'Individuals and the Development of Scriptoria', was delivered by **Susan Rankin** (University of Cambridge, UK). In her paper entitled '*Primus inter pares*: Notker of St Gall', Rankin discussed Notker's (c. 840-912) practice of correcting and editing texts through a series of surviving examples. Following Rankin, **Daniela Mairhofer** (Universität Wien, Austria) examined the two different stages of the so-called Gozbald minuscule as defined by Bischoff in her paper titled 'The Gozbald Minuscule: Definition, Problems, and Samples'. In her paper titled 'Alcuin and Caroline Minuscule: Hypotheses and Speculations', **Mary Garrison** (University of York, UK) considered Alcuin's (c. 735-804) involvement in bookmaking with regard to design and execution of manuscripts.

The session on 'Scribal Practices' started with **Mariken Teeuwen's** (Huygens ING and Universiteit Utrecht, the Netherlands) paper titled 'The Practice of Annotating Manuscripts in the Carolingian Period'. In her talk, Teeuwen introduced and provided examples from the research project she is currently leading: 'Marginal Scholarship: The Practice of Learning in the Early Middle Ages (c. 800-c. 1000)' whose primary aim is to analyse annotations in early medieval manuscripts. Reflecting on different practices of annotation, Teeuwen elaborated on questions like how we can quantify annotations and how we can distinguish between an original annotation and a later one. **Daniel J. DiCenso** (College of the Holy Cross, USA), on the other hand, concentrated on questions of production in a single manuscript in his talk titled 'How Many Scribes Does it Take to Make a Mass Chant Book?: Reflections on the Peculiar Scribal Practices in Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale, MS 10127-44' and offered insights into the producers and audience of such eclectic compilations.

The afternoon sessions focused on the Caroline minuscule in Italy and the final stages of the uses of the script. The session on 'Caroline Minuscule in Italy' included four speakers. In his talk titled 'Out of the Book: The Caroline Minuscule Utilized for Private and Solemn Acts in West Tuscany Between the Ninth and Twelfth Centuries', **Andrea Puglia** (Università degli Studi di Siena) discussed the use of Caroline minuscule in diplomatic texts and the main characteristics of this version of the script. **Laura Pani** (Università degli Studi di Udine, Italy) turned the focus on to the problems in studying witnesses of Caroline minuscule in Italy in her talk titled 'On the Study of North Italian Carolingian Manuscripts: Problems and Methods'. In her talk titled 'Toward a Regional Map of Bischoff's "Reformed" Caroline Minuscule Scripts in Eleventh-Century Italy', **Lila Yawn** (John Cabot

University, Italy) stated that there are more than 160 surviving witnesses that are written in the 'reformed' Caroline minuscule script. She argued that broad comparisons of disparate items might be the solution in localising these manuscripts. **Giuliana Capriolo** (Università degli Studi di Salerno, Italy) shared details of 23 fragments discovered in Salerno in her talk titled 'Inedited *excerpta* in Caroline Minuscule from the Area of Salerno' and stated that these new fragments can provide clues to circulation in the Rome-Salerno region.

In the final session, **Erik Kwakkel** (Universiteit Leiden, the Netherlands) focused on the later uses of the script in his talk titled 'The End: Caroline Minuscule in the Eleventh Century'. He considered the eleventh century as a transitional period which he labelled as 'the death of the Caroline and the birth of the Gothic'. More specifically, Kwakkel provided some quantitative and qualitative analyses coming out of his own recent research on eleventh-century manuscripts for the project called 'Turning Over a New Leaf: Manuscript Innovation in the Twelfth-Century Renaissance'. The Colloquium was concluded by the founders of the NSCM, **Anna Dorofeeva** and **Zachary Guiliano**, both of whom are based at the University of Cambridge. Their talk was titled '*Litterae carolinae* Prospectus-Survey and Summary', and provided insights to recent developments in the field as well as details of forthcoming events.

The Network for the Study of Caroline Minuscule has a dedicated website along with a Facebook page and Twitter account. Following the Inaugural Colloquium, later in the year, the NSCM went on organising a series of sessions as part of the Cambridge Medieval Palaeography Workshop in conjunction with the Centre for Material Texts. In addition to their plans on future colloquiums, the NSCM will also be sponsoring sessions at the next International Medieval Congress held annually in July at the University of Leeds. The NSCM has also been recently awarded a J. M. M. Hermans Grant by the Association Paléographique Internationale - Culture - Écriture - Société (APICES) for their Caroline Minuscule Mapping Project. You can become a member of the NSCM or join the mailing list by filling out the contact form on their website.